Faculty of Law

Overview of Corporate Liability for Environmental Harm from Domestic and International Law Perspectives

By

Song Yijie

Supervisor: Muruga Perumal Ramaswamy

A thesis presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Degree of Master of International Law at the University of Macau

July 2012
Declaration of Authorship

Student Name: Song Yijie

Student Number: MB04943-7

Entrance Academic Year: 2010

Program Enrolled: Master of Law in European Union Law, International Law and Comparative Law in English language

Area of Study: International Law

Title of the Thesis: Seeking Corporate Liability for Environmental Damage

Supervisor: Muruga Perumal Ramaswamy

I, SONG YIJIE, hereby declare that, I am the author of the above thesis and it is my original research work. This work has not been submitted anywhere else, either in part or whole, for a degree or other academic credits. I undertake the sole responsibility for any inaccuracy in this declaration.

Yours Sincerely,

Date: June 29th, 2012
Place: University of Macau
Signature: Song Yijie
Name: Song Yijie
Table of Treaties and Legal Documents

Alien Tort Claims Act (1789)
Criminal Law of the People's Republic of China (1997)
Environmental Protection Law of People’s Republic of China (1989)
Lugano Convention on Civil Liability for Damage Resulting from Activities Dangerous to the Environment (1993)
Marine Environmental Protection Law of the People’s Republic of China (1999)
OECD Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises (2011)
Paris Convention on Third Party Liability in the Field of Nuclear Energy (1960)
Rio Declaration on Environment and Development (1992)
Tort Law of the People’s Republic of China (2009)
Vienna Convention on Civil Liability for Nuclear Damage (1963)
Table of Cases

Beanal v. Freeport-McMoran (1999) 197 F.3d 161


Dow Chemical Company v. Castro Alfaro (1990) 786 S.W.2d 674

Flores v. Southern Peru Copper Corporation (2003) 414 F.3d 233

In re Oil Spill by the Amoco Cadiz off the Coast of France on March 16, 1978 (1984) 1984 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 17480


Trail Smelter Case (United States of America v. Canada) (1941)


Zaist v. Olson (1967) 154 Conn. 563
# CONTENTS

Chapter One: Introduction

1.1 Introduction ..................................................................................................................... 1  
1.2 Literature Review ........................................................................................................... 4  
1.3 Objectives of the Thesis ................................................................................................. 7  
1.4 Research Questions ....................................................................................................... 8  
1.5 Methodology .................................................................................................................. 9  
1.6 Scope and Limitations .................................................................................................... 10  
1.7 Chapter Layout ............................................................................................................. 12

Chapter Two: Corporate Liability for Environmental Damage: Concepts, Definitions, and Relevant Problems

2.1 An Overview of Relevant Concepts ............................................................................... 15  
2.1.1 The Scope of Environmental Damage .................................................................... 16  
2.1.2 Corporate Activities Causing Environmental Damage ......................................... 17  
2.1.3 Liability for Environmental Damage (Responsibility v. Liability) ........................ 18  
2.2 Corporate Liability for Environmental Damage Deserving Special Attention ........... 20  
2.2.1 The Legal Status and Basic Legal Structure of Corporations .................................. 20  
2.3 The Difficulty in Holding Transnational Corporations Liable for Their Environmental Damage ......................................................................................................................... 23  
2.3.1 The Basics of Transnational Corporations ............................................................... 24  
2.3.2 TNCs’ Activities Causing Environmental Damage ................................................ 28  
2.3.3 Factors Contributing to the Difficulty in the Attribution of TNCs’ Environmental Liability ................................................................................................................................................................................................. 29

Chapter 3: Seeking Legal Redress against TNCs for Their Environmental Damage through Different Avenues: the Home State Avenue and the Host State Avenue

3.1 Seeking TNCs’ Liability for Environmental Damage through the Host State Avenue ............................................................................................................... 36  
3.1.1 The Legal Basis for Jurisdiction of the Host State .................................................... 36  
3.1.2 Environmental Liability under the National Tort Law Regime ............................... 37  
3.1.3 The Disadvantages of Seeking Legal Redress in the Host State .............................. 40  
3.2 Seeking Legal Redress against TNCs for Their Environmental Damage through the Home State Avenue .................................................................................................................. 43
3.2.1 Home State Control of the TNCs ................................................................. 43
3.2.2 Seeking Legal Redress against TNCs for Environmental Damage through Foreign Direct Liability ................................................................................. 45

3.3 A Common Issue in Both Host State Redress and Home State Redress: TNCs’ Group Liability for Environmental Damage ......................................................... 58
  3.3.1 The Need to Consider Parent Company’s Liability for the Activities of Its Subsidiaries .................................................................................................................. 59
  3.3.2 The Traditional Legal Basis for Holding Parent Company Accountable .......... 61
  3.3.3 The New Approach to TNCs’ Group Liability ............................................. 67
  3.3.4 Current Situation of Liability Allocation in Transnational Corporate Group ...... 70

Chapter 4: International Law Governing the Issues Related to TNCs’ Environmental Responsibility or Liability for Environmental Damage .................................................. 71

  4.1 TNCs’ Environmental Liability at the International Law level: Two Approaches ...... 72
    4.1.1 International Environmental Law Addressing TNCs Liability Indirectly through the Obligations of States .................................................................................. 72
    4.1.2 International Standards Directly Addressing TNCs Environmental Responsibility ................................................................. 75

  4.2 The Role of State Responsibility in Handling Corporate Environmental Damage ...... 75
    4.2.1 State Responsibility for Transboundary Environmental Damage ................. 76
    4.2.2 Resorting to State Responsibility for Environmental Damage Caused by Corporations ......................................................................................................... 78
    4.2.3 The Difficulty in Resorting to State Responsibility for Corporate Environmental Damage ......................................................................................................... 80

  4.3 International Civil Liability Conventions Harmonizing Environmental Liability in Some Specific Areas and Their Role in Seeking Legal Redress against Corporations ...... 81
    4.3.1 The Civil Liability Conventions Dealing with a Specific Area......................... 82
    4.3.2 The Council of Europe’s Lugano Convention for Damage Resulting from Activities Dangerous to the Environment ................................................. 87
    4.3.3 The Evaluation of the Role of International Civil Liability Regimes ............... 88

  4.4 International Organization Norms and Guidelines Directly Addressing TNCs’ Environmental Responsibility ................................................................. 90
    4.4.1 International Organization Instruments Regulating Corporate Environmental Practice ............................................................................................................... 91
4.4.1.2 The OECD Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises ......................................... 93

4.4.2 The Characteristics of the International Instruments .............................................. 97

4.5 The Proposal to Hold TNCs Liable for Their Environmental Damage by Using
International Human Rights Law .................................................................................. 99

4.5.1 The Value and Theoretical Foundation of the Human Rights Approach for the
Environmental Claims ................................................................................................. 99

4.5.2 The Existing Substantive Human Rights and Procedural Rights Relevant to the
Protection of the Victims of the Environmental Damage and the Natural Environment
....................................................................................................................................... 101

4.5.3 Appealing for the Establishment of the Human Right to a Healthy Environment 103

4.5.4 The Proposal to Use the Right to a Healthy Environment to Address TNCs’
Accountability for Environmental Damage .................................................................... 104

4.6 The Role of International Criminal Law against TNCs for Their Environmental
Damage .......................................................................................................................... 106

4.6.1 The Significance of International Criminal Liability for Environmental Damage 106

4.6.2 The Proposal of an International Tribunal to Hold TNCs Accountable for the
Environmental Crimes ................................................................................................. 107

Chapter 5: A specific Study of the Legal Issues Related to the TNCs Liability for the
Environmental Damage in the Context of China ................................................................ 110

5.1 Current Situation of TNCs with Subsidiaries in China, the Accompanying
Environmental Problems, and the Corresponding Reasons ........................................ 110

5.1.1 TNCs Establishing Subsidiaries in China and the Accompanying Environmental
Problems ....................................................................................................................... 110

5.1.2 Reasons for TNCs Environmental Pollution in China ........................................... 112

5.2 The Concept of TNCs in Chinese Law and the Corresponding Regulatory Regime .......... 114

5.2.1 The Hierarchical Chinese Legal Regime Governing TNCs Practice in China ......... 114

5.2.1.4 The Relevant International Law ...................................................................... 117

5.3 TNCs Environmental Liability under Current Chinese Legal Regime .......................... 118

5.3.1 Administrative Liability and Comments ................................................................ 118

5.3.2 Criminal Liability and Comments ..................................................................... 120

5.3.3 Civil Liability ..................................................................................................... 121

5.4 Enforcement of the Liability Rules against TNCs in China ....................................... 124